

**BASIC
EDUCATION
STRATEGY
FOR
PAKISTAN**



2018



رَبِّ زِدْنِي عِلْمًا

o Allah, Increase us in Knowledge!

“The only thing that is more
expensive than education is ignorance.”

Benjamin Franklin

About this paper and its transformative purpose

Illiteracy and ignorance of large majority of the people of Pakistan at a time when rest of the world is benefiting from exponential technologies in the digital age is undoubtedly the biggest handicap that has kept this sixth most populous country in the world backward and virtually left behind. This paper on Basic Education Strategy discusses fundamental issues and reasons that are responsible for failure of our public sector education over the last 70 years, due to which the majority of the population remains either illiterate or semi-literate. Based on success of various public private initiatives, including cost effective project implementation and better quality service delivery, this paper proposes that the responsibility for imparting education should be transferred from pure government departments to some form of public private partnership, while overall accountability and funding remains the responsibility of the government. While this is quite an unusual strategy that may cause pervasive disruption, the writers believe that owing to the critical importance of this sector and great potential of success of the concepts contained in this paper, it is highly desirable that our education governance is re-engineered based on proposals contained in this paper.

This paper has been written by Dr. Amjad Waheed, CEO NAFA and Syed Asad Ali Shah, Managing Partner Deloitte, on behalf of the “C100 Think Tank’s”, Education Committee. The C100 Think Tank comprises of over 250 Corporate CEOs, Chairmen, Presidents and senior Leaders, which was envisioned by Mr. Zeshan Afzal, Founder of the Think Tank. The Education Committee, chaired by Mr. Feroz Khan, Chairman Omar Jibran Group, held detailed deliberations on the dismal state of education in the country, discussed various ideas and possible solutions over a period of ten months under various meetings of the “C100 Education Committee”. Mr. Amin Hashwani played a key role in the committee and hosted several meetings of the Committee, facilitating the finalization of this report.

The committee believes that the concepts and recommendations contained in this paper need to be disseminated to all stakeholders, including political leaders, government functionaries both federal and provincial, academia and others who have interest in the education, so that appropriate changes are incorporated in our education framework for achieving the goal of universal education in a period one decade.

An Unusual Strategy to Educate Pakistan

1. Executive Summary

1.1 Based on review of the existing poor state of the education in Pakistan (as summarized in paragraph 2 of this paper), which reflects that we have lost 70 years without making any significant impact on improving the knowledge and skills of our people, there is no doubt that “business as usual” will not make any positive impact. In order to bring about a positive change for moving towards universal education in minimum possible time, and for achieving targets of UN sustainable development goal 4 on education, following key steps are required:

- a) All political parties should agree to declare a national education emergency, together with agreement to address this emergency by making a commitment to take all steps required for education of our people, giving education the top most priority, both in terms of funding and focus of various governments, to improve the future of our nation. While there has been a Charter of Democracy, and a Charter of Economy has often been discussed, the most critical Charter required for consensus amongst all political parties is the “Charter to Educate our People” to enhance their knowledge and skills to bring them to 21st century from 19th century.
- b) Education governance needs to be re-engineered to improve the quality of education that ensures enhanced learning outcomes of the public sector schools, as elaborated below by taking some unusual steps through involvement of private sector, independent professionals and educationists embracing exponential technologies and innovation, and establishing effective accountability mechanisms for education outcomes. The proposals of restructuring education encompass establishing autonomous and efficient organizations for effective education management that are free from inherent limitations in the government structures. The proposals submitted in this paper are fundamentally based on principle of taking away the execution of

education from pure public sector, whereby funding and overall accountability remains in public sector but the responsibility for execution and implementation is either given to private sector or a combination of public and private sector, thus eliminating the need to comply with normal codal requirements in the government, avoiding the culture of red tape and extremely slow bureaucratic procedures.

c) Budget allocation for education sector needs to be increased from 2.2% of the GDP to 5% of the GDP in five years, as proposed below:

- 1st Year: 3.0% of GDP
- 2nd Year: 3.5% of GDP
- 3rd Year: 4.0% of GDP
- 4th Year: 4.5% of GDP
- 5th Year: 5.0% of GDP

d) Major emphasis should be placed on cost effective public private partnership models that have already been tried and tested in two provinces to bring much larger number of children in schools and improve learning outcomes within shorter period at lower cost.

e) In order to educate out of school children and illiterate adults, cost effective Non-formal Education Programs needs to be implemented, mainly through public private partnerships, with maximum utilization of public sector infrastructure.

f) For improving learning outcomes, the most critical reform required is to enhance the investment on teachers, by ensuring merit based recruitment, paying market based salaries, implementing continuing professional development programs, emphasizing innovation in teaching methodologies, using enabling technologies and ensuring accountability.

g) A comprehensive national education plan (CNEP) should be prepared that aims to achieve universal education in a period of 10 years to meet the constitutional requirements mentioned in the ensuing paragraphs,

and also to meet global sustainable development goal (SDG-4) on education. Such a plan, which includes quarterly targets, should be made public, and federal and provincial governments should be obligated to report to the nation on quarterly basis on actual results compared to the planned target. The CNEP will need to be updated on annual basis, keeping in view the learnings from actual experience, outcomes, developments in other jurisdictions and potential use of emerging technologies.

- 1.2 The proposals given in this paper are conceptual in nature and may also be implemented with some modifications, provided the basic principles proposed in the ensuing paragraphs are embraced in the design and implementation of education framework.

2. Background and present state of education in Pakistan

- 2.1 Quaid-e-Azam Mohammed Ali Jinnah stated that Education is a matter of life and death for our country. And Aristotle, one of the greatest philosophers of all times said that “The educated differs from uneducated as much as the living from the dead”. We have not only ignored the Quaid's advice and Aristotle’s wise words for over seven decades, but have done everything opposite of Quaid’s advice, by totally neglecting the education of our people, as after 70 years of independence, Pakistan has the largest proportion of illiterate people as a percentage of its population. This is the biggest impediment to the progress of the country, as the most important resource for any country is the quality and skill of its people.
- 2.2 According to the report of the International Commission on Financing Global Education Opportunity, an investment of \$ 1 in one year of education results in earnings and benefits of \$ 10 in the case of developing countries. Pakistan being one of the most underdeveloped countries, especially in terms of its state of education, there can be no better investment than investing in the education of its people. Unfortunately, we have failed to make this critical investment.

2.3 Above report also states that owing to pervasive impact of technology in today's fast changing world, "up to half of the world's jobs – nearly 2 billion – are at high risk of disappearing due to automation in the coming decades". Obviously, highly populated countries like Pakistan with one of the lowest rates of literacy, and overwhelming majority of its people with either no or very low level skills, are at greatest risk.

2.4 This paper discusses the dismal state of our education, the basic underlying reasons for such state, and proposes an unusual strategy to change direction and overcome the most serious crisis the nation is faced with in shortest possible time.

2.5 The following facts highlight pathetic state of education, due to which Pakistan's human resources have become its biggest weakness:

- Pakistan is ranked second in the global ranking of countries with the highest number of out-of-school children, with 23 million out of 51 million children of school going age(5-15 years) not attending school. It is also ranked as one of the ten worst countries in the world in education index of UNESCO, and it is the only country in this group from our region of South Asia..
- Seventy seven percent of out-of-school Pakistani children have never been to school, while 23% dropped out. Key reasons of drop out are lack of basic facilities, poor quality of education, teacher absenteeism, corporal punishment, and financial situation of the family.
- Net enrollment rate (NER) is defined as number of students enrolled divided by the total number of children in the same age group for that level of education. Net enrollment ratio in Pakistan is 57% at the primary level (classes 1-V), 22% at the secondary level (classes VI-VIII), and 14% at the high level (classes IX-X). These are among the lowest NERs in the world.

- Bangladesh has improved access to primary school education at double the rate as compared with Pakistan over the past 20 years, while India is reducing the number of out-of-school children at ten times the rate as compared with Pakistan.
- About half of the children in class five in Pakistan cannot read a story book in Urdu, a sentence in English, or perform simple two-digit division.
- About 43% of government schools in the country are in a dangerous condition, and lack basic facilities such as furniture, bathrooms, boundary walls, electricity, and running water.
- Pakistan is ranked 168 out of 188 countries in the World based on primary and secondary school enrollment. Countries ranked below Pakistan include Gambia, Senegal, Equatorial Guinea, Burkina Faso, Sudan, Cote d'Ivoire, Niger, Papua New Guinea, Djibouti, Eritrea, Tanzania, Central African Republic, Turkmenistan, (Source: Human Development Report (HDR) 2016).
- Total government spending on education, including Federal and Provincial, is about 2.2% of GDP in Pakistan. Pakistan is ranked 169 out of 188 countries of the World based on government expenditure on education as a percentage of the size of an economy (Source: HDR, 2016).
- Pakistan workforce presently has an average of 6 years of education. For every one year increase in secondary education for the entire workforce, the economy (GDP) of Pakistan can increase by 13% (US\$ 39 billion).

2.6 National and Provincial Net Enrollment Ratio (NER) at the Primary Level (2015-16)

	Male %	Female %	Total %
Pakistan	56	51	54
Punjab	60	58	59
Sindh	52	44	48
KPK	58	47	53
Balochistan	38	26	33

Source: Pakistan Economic Survey, 2016-17

- Break-down of children by education (5-15 years old)

	Total (millions)	Out of School (millions)
Pakistan	48.76	23.03
Punjab	26	11.4
Sindh	12	6.7
KPK	6.8	2.5
Balochistan	2.7	1.8
Azad J & K &	1.26	0,63

Source: Alif Ailaan, 2016

2.7 Education – Financial Statistics

Rupees in Billion							
2016-17	Pakistan GDP	Total Govt. Revenues	Total Govt. Budget	Govt. Education Spending	GST Revenue Estimate	Education % of GDP	Education % of Govt. Budget
Federal - GOP	29,896.0	3,772.1	4,985.9	114.3	1445.0	0.38%	2.29%
Punjab	17,040.7	1,755.1	1,755.1	313	84.2	1.83%	5.36%
Sindh	8,968.8	858.9	855.7	168.3	78.0	1.88%	19.67%
KPK	2,391.7	517.0	517.0	47.7	10.0	1.99%	9.22%
Balochistan	1,494.8	216.0	289.4	49.1	4.8	3.29%	16.97%

Source: Budget Document & Economic Survey, 2016-17

2.8 Recent improvements in Education

While we have observed some improvements in education in recent years in three provinces, especially the reforms in governance and management of education in the Provinces of Punjab and KP, the impact is considerably smaller than required. For instance, in Sindh, the government has initiated monitoring of teachers' presence through biometric system being implemented through specially recruited monitors using biometric technology, which has improved teachers presence in the government schools. In Punjab, owing to ownership of the Chief Minister, engagement of a renowned education consultant Dr. Michael Barber, implementation of teacher training and some other reforms, there have been significant improvements in management of education sector, that has resulted in improvement in net enrolment, attendance of teachers as well as students, physical improvement needs of the schools (missing facilities) have been largely addressed, besides some improvement in education outcomes. In KP, an independent Monitoring Unit has been established, an SMS based help application has been implemented to assist teachers and significant improvements in the school infrastructure has been made through the use of parent teacher associations. Owing to greater attention to education by political leadership, there has been considerable improvements in the education outcomes, especially KP and Punjab, while impact in Sindh may take time to become visible. However, despite such improvements, the overall pace and impact on enrolment and learning outcomes is substantially lower than required, when we compare this progress with the target of achieving the sustainable development goals by 2030, or when we compare our progress compared to other comparable nations.

3. Constitutional and legal requirements on education

3.1 After the passage of the 18th Amendment to the Constitution, education has been completely devolved to the provincial governments. As per Article 25A of the Constitution of Pakistan, it is a fundamental right of all citizens of Pakistan, between the ages of five and sixteen, to receive

free education, and it is the obligation of relevant governments to provide free and compulsory education to all Pakistani children from the ages of five to sixteen.

3.2 Under Article 37(b) of the Constitution, the governments are obligated to "remove illiteracy and provide free and compulsory secondary education within minimum possible period"

3.3 Keeping in view the above background, it is clear that all governments in Pakistan are in serious violation of the constitutional obligations owing to two fundamental reasons. 1) the funding allocation on education has remained significantly lower than required; and 2) owing to bad governance and management, most of the funds spent are largely wasted with very low education outcomes.

3.4 Therefore, it is imperative for the federal and provincial governments to make fundamental changes in their approach to education, as the past approaches have not worked, in order to fulfill their constitutional obligations, including legislative, financial, and administrative measures to ensure that all children are provided the means to obtain decent education. The legislation should bind the federal and provincial governments to provide sufficient education budgets, as well as improve governance and accountability to ensure that such spending results in "quality education to all".

4. Strategy to reform the public sector education governance for better education outcomes

4.1 Current dismal state of education clearly demonstrates that present centralized and bureaucratic government school system has failed to deliver results, owing to the inherent limitations of the public sector governance, and lack of focus of federal and provincial governments on this vital subject. Under this system, the administrative and financial powers rest with those sitting in federal and provincial capitals hundreds of miles away from the schools. The bureaucrats appointed to deliver results are usually generalists and are mostly posted on arbitrary basis,

based on personal preferences without use of an objective criteria, for a tenure that may last for a few months or maximum three years, who usually lack commitment and motivation to deliver required outcomes. Most of the secretaries and senior officers posted in education departments do not have long term commitment to education, which is essential to achieve sustainable progress. Impediments that undermine governance include the red tape (including very slow process of moving files and decision making), paper based documentation, manual filing and communication that takes a long time for decision making, low salaries, political interference, corruption and nepotism. Excessive centralized systems, both in federal and provincial governments, where all significant decisions are taken by the Prime Minister in the case of federal government, and the Chief Ministers in the case of provinces and an archaic system of moving summaries for decisions through various forums is one of the key impediments to timely decision making. Further, there is total lack of teamwork and ineffective systems of communication due to which even good ideas generated, and policies developed, rarely get implemented. The existing system of budgeting and release of funds is archaic, as there is no performance or outcome based budgeting, that provides links and accounts for funds on the basis of outcomes. There is absolutely no system of accountability, whereby the political leadership and bureaucrats are held to account for poor outcomes or for not meeting even reasonable targets and conversely rewarding better performance. There have been several education policies and plans, but the results have rarely matched targets envisaged, and despite non-performance, no one has ever been held accountable. The customers (parents and students) have no choice or say in the system, and are ignored in decision making and in making policies.

- 4.2 Keeping in view the foregoing limitations , and total lack of progress over the past 70 years, the most critical steps to improve education outcomes in the government schools include induction of right human resources (especially teachers), decentralization to empower school management, establishing effective accountability at the school level together with effective oversight and monitoring system from the top. It

is virtually impossible to implement such steps given the inherent limitations in the government in current centralized and hugely inefficient structures as described above. It is not difficult to understand that one bureaucrat (as operational management is largely centralized with departmental secretaries) sitting in federal or provincial capitals cannot manage 30 to 40 thousand schools, following all the government rules and regulations, that seem to have been developed to stall the government's efficiency and effectiveness rather than accomplishing any defined objectives. It is obvious that a major improvement in education outcomes cannot be achieved with "business as usual approach". The following steps (that are principle based and may be tailored / modified based on underlying principles of creating efficient, empowered and accountable education organizations) propose major transformational changes, that can result in huge improvements in our basic education outcomes, provided there is political will and commitment to recognize the emergency situation in the education and the need to take unusual steps to address the education emergency we face. For this purpose, we believe that the government education departments need to be transformed and converted as Modern Corporate Organizations (MCOs), working as efficient corporate sector entities in line with international best practices of governance and management, with public funding coupled with parliamentary oversight, but autonomous and empowered professional management and governance.

4.3 Restructuring and conversion of government education departments into effective, efficient, empowered and accountable organizations

4.3.1 Since existing federal and provincial government departments responsible for basic education (primary and secondary education) have miserably failed to deliver the results, it is proposed that such departments undergo total reinvention and reengineering. For this purpose, to make such departments more efficient and effective, it is proposed that these should be converted into autonomous statutory Federal and Provincial Basic Education Organizations (BEOs) that function as modern corporate organizations and are efficient, effective,

empowered and accountable. Such BEOS will be governed and managed by nine or seven member board of directors. Such boards will comprise of combination of people from private sector and bureaucrats selected on the basis of simple criteria of competence, commitment and integrity. The Chairman and other members of the Boards of such BEOs should be appointed based on such criteria so as to get the people who have appropriate knowledge, experience, commitment, integrity and time necessary for effective governance of these institutions. The Federal and Provincial BEOs will report administratively to the Prime Minister and the Chief Ministers respectively, and will also be accountable to parliamentary and provincial assembly committees on basic education.

4.3.2 Functions and responsibilities of the BEOs, vested in their boards will include:

- Developing education vision, strategies and policies. The overall vision will be to achieve a target of universal education as envisaged in SDG-4 in a period of 12 years or by 2030.
- The Board of Directors of the BEOs will develop and adopt a code of governance for their own functioning, which will be approved by the federal and provincial cabinets as the case may be.
- The Boards will develop the organization structure of BEOs, which should include central and district level organizations that are considered necessary for efficient and effective management of such organizations for accomplishing their objectives.
- In designing the organizations, effort will be made to empower school level management, with appropriate empowerment and decentralization of decision making for day to day matters, while strategic decisions and oversight will be the responsibility of the Boards.

4.3.3 Functional organization of the BEOs may broadly comprise of:

- School Management Function that will comprise of provincial, district, tehsil level and school level management. However, the management system will be designed to empower school level decision making with reasonable autonomy and accountability.
- Finance function, responsible for resource mobilization, budgeting and financial control, cash management and accounting
- Curriculum design and implementation.
- Engineering and infrastructure
- Human Resource Function, which will endeavor to establish an effective merit based recruitments and effective performance appraisal system that rewards good performance and penalizes substandard performance.
- Teacher Training and Continuing Education.
- Monitoring and Evaluation to be implemented through a credible third party.
- Information & Communication Technologies (ICT)
- Public Private Partnership
- Non-formal Education
- Internal Audit

4.3.4 The Board will appoint a Chief Executive Officer and other heads of functions, purely on merit, who will be offered market based remuneration and incentives packages that are sufficient to attract and retain the best talent. In carrying out executive search, the Board may also consider appointing foreign nationals, in pursuit of finding the best and most suited human resources.

- 4.3.5 The entire staff, infrastructure and resources of existing education ministry / provincial school education departments will be transferred to such BEOs respectively, except for a small team that may be retained that can serve as a working group to assist the federal & provincial governments for coordination, oversight and accountability of BEOs.
- 4.3.6 While the BEOs will retain all the existing staff at their current emoluments / salary packages, they will establish effective accountability and performance appraisal systems to ensure that every person is performing to the best of his / her abilities that contribute to enhanced learning outcomes. Further, all new appointments to fill the identified gaps / vacancies will be strictly on merit. Furthermore, the BEOs will be authorized to adjust the remuneration packages of the employees, based on their performance.
- 4.3.7 The Boards will be responsible for overall policy making, strategy, appointment of Chief Executive and senior management and holding them accountable through periodic performance appraisal, and oversight to ensure effective functioning of the BEOs. As part of policy, the BEOs priority will be to expeditiously operationalize all viable public sector schools within their jurisdictions to ensure effectiveness of education delivery. Effort should also be made to consolidate the schools and close unviable schools where there is no possibility of increase in enrolment. The BEO's will not take or construct any new schools in the first five years, as their priority will be to consolidate and operationalize the existing schools. All new schools should preferably be established by organizations mentioned in paragraph 5 under the model of public funding and private execution.
- 4.3.8 Within three months of establishing of the BEOs, the Boards will be required to develop their visions and plans, with quarterly targets for improving education outcomes within their jurisdictions, and submit the same to the federal and provincial governments respectively for approval by respective cabinets.

4.3.9 The Boards of BEO's will establish an effective digital management system, including appropriate ERP's and other ICT systems to ensure effective communication, financial and non-financial data capture, processing and reporting on daily, weekly, monthly and quarterly basis that provide both financial and education outcome related reports to the managements, the boards and respective governments. Further, this function will also set up a unit of data analytics that enables data capture and analysis for effective decision making.

4.3.10 The Boards will be responsible to prepare quarterly reports, providing the quarterly results and education outcomes compared to the planned targets. The school monitoring system would capture data on each school, its enrollment, attendance, teachers, infrastructure, and six monthly and annual academic results.

4.4 Third Party Annual Assessment and Validation:

4.4.1 The federal and provincial governments will appoint third party professional organizations to carry out annual assessment of BEOs, third party validation of education outcomes, together with their recommendations for corrective actions where performance has not been satisfactory, and issue their reports to the Parliamentary Committees on education.

4.4.2 Effective and timely corrective actions will be required to be taken to address shortcomings and deficiencies identified in the third party assessment / validation reports.

4.5 School and Student Management Systems

4.5.1 BEOs will develop school and student management systems comprising of:

- 1) Establishing a School Management Committees (SMC), comprising of parents, local professionals / community

members, head teacher and one or two teachers. Key role of the SMC may include:

- a. monitoring the working of the school including the basic facilities provided to the students, the quality of education;
 - b. prepare and recommend school budget and development plan;
 - c. monitor the utilization of the funding received from the Government;
 - d. evaluate the principal/ head teacher and teachers based on their performance;
 - e. Oversee continuing education program for the teachers;
 - f. Submit simple annual report to the BEO on school's performance compared to the plan.
- 2) Establish a system whereby all students enrolled in the school under the administrative control of BEOs are monitored from the date of their enrollment.
 - 3) Ensure and monitor admission, attendance and completion of education by every child;
 - 4) Capture data relating to student teacher ratio in each school, and take steps to ensure that appropriate balance that is necessary for good education outcomes is maintained.
 - 5) Effective school based budgeting and financial control systems are in place
 - 6) Mobilizing funds for requirements of the school, not only from the government, but also other private sector donors.

4.6 Training and Professional Development of Teachers and Administrators

4.6.1 BEOs will:

- 1) Implement a program of training and professional development of teachers, that ensures both, pre-service training as well as continuing professional development programs for school teachers and administrators to build their capacity and enhance

their ability of imparting knowledge and skills using latest evolving methodologies, tools and enabling technologies;

- 2) Develop a teacher information system to ensure capture and maintenance of appropriate data and reports for tracking attendance, career development and performance of each teacher that is linked with the assessment results of students;
- 3) Since knowledge and skill of existing teachers is considerably lower than required, a major effort, investment and special program is required to enhance the capacity of such teachers to enable them to provide more effective learning; and
- 4) As a significant number of teachers who have been inducted through political patronage or flawed system of induction are incapable of teaching, an appropriate scheme needs to be designed and implemented whereby such teachers need to be identified through carefully designed screening system, and separated from school learning systems without making them unemployed.

4.7 Innovation, Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs)

4.7.1 All BEOs will have an Innovation and ICT function, headed by Chief Innovation and Technology Officer, who will be responsible to assist the Board of Directors and Management in adoption of cost effective evolving technologies to assist in enhancing education outcomes.

4.7.2 Improving the performance of existing education systems is not enough. Far-reaching innovation is needed to equip new generation of students with the new knowledge and skills they need in the new and fast changing world, to educate millions of children effectively and efficiently all over Pakistan, by taking advantage of new technology and better understanding of how children learn.

4.7.3 Gradually, all schools should have wifi connectivity, and all teachers should be given tabs. Through these tabs the teachers should be able to access teaching tutorials and lessons offered by organizations such as Sabak Foundation and others. This will help them to enhance their teaching skills and make greater impact on learning outcomes.

4.7.4 Recently, most governments have initiated technology based solutions to improve education management, monitoring and learnings. Sindh has introduced biometric system of monitoring of teachers attendance, Punjab has digitized syllabus books, augmented with videos / audio recordings that are available on <http://elearn.punjab.gov.pk/>, while KP has implemented an SMS based support to teachers. All such initiatives, and many others would need to be embraced with even greater use of technology as a tool for enhancing learning outcomes.

4.7.5 One excellent example of use of technology to enhance monitoring and education standards of existing schools and teachers in Pakistan is by the charity, 'United We Reach'. It has created a curriculum and software system that improves teachers, enhances student learning outcomes dramatically, and creates transparency. BEOs will study such systems to utilize them to enhance education outcomes as much as possible.

4.7.6 'United We REACH' teaching system: (i) enhances existing books to international standards, currently focused on Prep, KG and 1st Grade; (ii) creates Lesson Plan Scripts (LPS) for each class and each subject. These are prepared by master teachers (they have 40 master teachers). LPS details each and every thing that needs to be done in a class. The focus is on critical thinking, creative learning, and collaborative work. Students are encouraged to ask questions. These LPS are loaded into tablets. . Teachers use the tablets to teach the class by following the exact LPS details.

4.8 Resources and Funding

4.8.1 Investment in Education is undoubtedly the smartest investment a nation can make, as it provides highest return in terms of earnings and

well-being of its citizens. According to a recent report of International Commission on Financing Global Education Opportunity “The case for investing in education is indisputable. Education is the fundamental human right. It is critical for long term economic growth and essential for the achievement of all the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals. A dollar invested in an additional year of schooling, particularly of girls, generates earnings and health benefits of \$ 10 in low income countries”.

4.8.2 Total government spending on education in FY 15-16 was Rs 663 billion in the country. Of this, Rs 561 billion was current expenditure, primarily spent on teachers’ salaries and Rs 102 billion was development spending. There are about 150,000 government schools in the country. As mentioned in preceding paragraphs, about 43% of these schools have buildings that are dangerous and sub-standard, putting the lives of school children at risk. Over 40% of government schools also lack electricity, a boundary wall, furniture, clean drinking water, and toilets. Even if we assume that it will cost Rs 2 million per school to provide the basic facilities and safety, the total amount needed is Rs 300 billion. Further, owing to load shedding in rural areas, most of the schools operate without electricity, hence significant investment is required to provide solar back up to all public sector schools. Substantial investment will be required in inducting qualified managers and teachers to fill the gaps in the areas such as significant improvement in school infrastructure, major induction of qualified teachers to replace large number of teachers not able to teach, total overhaul of teacher training system, using enabling technologies to strengthen teaching and learning mechanisms, for data capture, monitoring, reporting, communication and dissemination of relevant information to the stakeholders for enhancing effectiveness education management. . Therefore,, to cover these investments, and to catch up with huge gap in our education outcomes compared to the target of achieving the target of SDG-4, we need to substantially increase overall investment on education to at least 3% of the GDP or around Rs. one trillion per year immediately to provide required funding to the BEOs, and then it needs to be gradually enhanced to 5% of the GDP over five year period.

4.8.3 Federal and Provincial Governments will be responsible for providing sufficient funds through their budgets to BEOs to meet their requirements, visions and strategies duly approved by such governments. There will be effective internal and external audit systems to ensure accountability of all such funds, including linkage with education outcomes.

4.9 Examination Commissions

4.9.1 Independent Examination Commissions will be established by the federal and provincial governments (in provinces where there is no system of assessment of children for classes lower than class 9th), which will be responsible for carrying out periodic assessment of students. Such assessments should initially be started for class 5 and Class 8 for each school to provide evidence of education outcomes. Standard can be defined as minimum passing rate of students in a school.

4.9.2 The Commissions will be responsible for oversight of the secondary boards of education that are currently responsible for annual examinations from class 9 to class 12. Currently, there are serious concerns about the credibility of such examinations owing to pervasive copy culture and corruption, and these boards have failed to implement appropriate mechanisms for credible and reliable examinations of students. Consequently, these Commissions will be required to take necessary steps to ensure that quality and credibility of existing examination system is restored. Further, these commissions will establish credible systems of testing for children of classes 3 to 8 through appropriately trained inspectors / examiners who will periodically visit all schools to carry out necessary assessments. If a school fails to achieve a certain overall passing rate for its students, the principal / head teacher of the school should be held accountable. If a class fails to achieve a certain passing rate, the teacher(s) of that class should be held accountable. The salaries, promotions and rewards of the Principal and the teachers should be directly linked to the performance of their schools. The education standards such as the

passing rate of students should be gradually raised as the overall quality of education improves.

- 4.9.3 Examination Commissions will also be governed by their boards of governors, and will be funded by respective federal and provincial governments. They will also work under federal and provincial governments, together with appropriate oversight of relevant parliamentary and provincial assembly committees.

5. Strategy of Public Funding Private Execution under Public Private Partnership

- 5.1 Rural families in Pakistan, on average, spend 17% of their income on their children's education. The fact that the Government of Pakistan spends less than 2.5% of Pakistan's income (GDP) on education illustrates the lack of importance the Government places on education versus even rural families (Source: Education Emergency Pakistan (EEP, 2011))
- 5.2 Even illiterate parents are able to identify good schools in their areas, and can judge the quality of education that their children are receiving. Surveys have shown that 80% of parents would rate a school as "good" or "very good" even if it had a roof that leaks, a broken boundary wall and desks, no free textbooks, but teachers who were always present and highly motivated (Source: EEM, 2011)
- 5.3 Contrary to the popular myth that illiterate parents do not wish to send their children to school, the results of a national opinion survey revealed that 85% of parents believed that education made people better citizens, reduces extremism, and prepares children to get better jobs. Only 4% of parents whose children were not enrolled in a school said that they had "no use of education" (Source: EEM, 2011)
- 5.4 About 60% of children in Pakistan are attending government schools, and the remaining 40% private schools. Parents of over 90% children attending private schools pay a fee of Rs. 1000 per month or less.

- 5.5 Teachers in government schools are paid much higher salaries than their counterparts in low-cost private schools. However, this does not translate into better teaching quality and commitment. Government school teachers are on average absent one out of five days in a week, mostly appointed and posted on political basis and they are not held accountable for not performing their duties diligently or for poor education outcomes, as reflected in the poor learning outcomes of children in government schools (Source: EEM, 2011).
- 5.6 According to LEAPS, ASER and several other studies in Pakistan, children learn more in low-cost private schools and outperform their counterparts in government schools in maths, science, and other subjects. Furthermore, there are thousands of ghost government schools, schools where there are no or very few students throughout Pakistan, where teachers are drawing regular salaries without performing their duties.
- 5.7 Owing to ineffective governance and management, public sector schools are mismanaged, there is lack of accountability of teachers for learning outcomes, and they cost much more than the private schools.
- 5.8 Poor parents prefer to pay a fee from their low incomes to send their children to low-cost private schools rather than the “free” government schools. This is a testament that such private schools provide a better standard of education than that provided by government schools. About ten million poor students are presently studying in low-cost private schools.
- 5.9 Keeping in view the foregoing facts, it is proposed that all new schools should be established under some form of public private partnerships, under the principle of public funding and private execution. Punjab Education Foundation, Sindh Education Foundation, schools being run by Education Management Organizations (EMOs) under Sindh Basic Education Programme and school adoption programme are some of the public private partnership models that have already been implemented successfully, where the learning outcomes are largely better and the

cost of education for the government is lower than the public sector schools. This will also enable the governments to provide free compulsory education to very large number of children with much better learning outcomes.

5.10 Expanding the PEF and SEF networks to cover out of school children.

5.10.1 As mentioned earlier, there are about 23 million children (5-15 years old) who are out of school. Presently about 15 million children are studying in government schools countrywide. To educate 23 million out of school children, the federal and provincial governments will need to build thousands of schools, invest on related infrastructure, induction of teachers, teacher training and other incidentals costing hundreds of billions of rupees. There is huge waste and corruption in the building and maintenance of schools. As discussed before, teachers are generally not hired on merit in government schools and a large majority of them are not competent to teach. It is very difficult to fire an incompetent teacher, and even if he or she is fired for non-performance, such person is usually able to get a stay from the courts.

5.10.2 It is no secret that the standard of education in government schools has deteriorated sharply over the years. Several studies have shown that the government schools and teachers lack accountability, efficiency, and ability in comparison to their counterparts in low cost private schools, or privately managed government funded free schools.

5.10.3 There is an alternate education model where the government does not need to incur this huge cost of building the schools. The government can encourage the private sector to play a role in the construction and running of schools. The government's role is then limited to simply providing per child cost for education, monitoring the quality of education and ensuring that the money provided is being put to proper use. The government issues a monthly education fee voucher to the schools managed by private sector under the umbrella of PEF / SEF type of organizations. By allowing the private sector to build and operate the schools, the government will be able to significantly reduce its cost

incurred in construction of thousands of schools required to accommodate out-of-school children and reallocate such resources for up gradation and rehabilitation of thousands of existing government schools which presently lack boundary walls, clean drinking water facility, toilets, electricity and qualified teachers.

5.10.4 The Punjab Education Foundation has been operating for several years on such Education Fee Voucher system. The PEF provides government funding to low-cost private schools in order to provide education to the less fortunate students. Moreover, the PEF is able to impart a better quality of education than that imparted by government schools at a much lower cost. Around 3 million less privileged students are presently enrolled in the PEF program under this public private partnership program, and are receiving a decent standard of education at a cost that is substantially lower than that incurred by the schools run by the Punjab Government. PEF has a state of the art Information & Communication Technologies (ICT) system to ensure transparency and efficiency. PEF sends inspectors to hold Quality Assurance Tests of the low-cost private schools and their students every year. If a school does not maintain a good standard it does not qualify for the voucher system partnership. This has forced these schools to hire better teachers so that they can qualify for the government voucher system. Under this system, the poor parent also has a choice to move his or her child from school A to school B, if not satisfied with the quality of the child's education. Thus, the market forces play their role in ensuring quality education. The World Bank has recognized the PEF as one of the most cost-effective program globally for raising school enrollment.

5.10.5 A similar model is also being followed by the Sindh Education Foundation, funded by the Sindh government. Presently around 500,000 students across Sindh are studying under this system, including many in the most remote areas of the province at a very nominal cost of Rs. 500 to Rs. 700 per child per month. The quality of education is better than that of government schools managed by the Sindh Education Department, where the cost to educate per child per month is very high at about Rs 3,500.

5.10.6 The Voucher System is the most plausible solution to quickly educate millions of out-of-school children in Pakistan, as the federal and provincial governments neither have the huge financial resources required to build thousands of schools, nor do they have the governance structures in place to ensure accountability of schools, and improve education outcomes.

6. Non-Formal Education (NFE)

6.1 Non-formal education is a flexible system of education, which is aimed at providing necessary learning to those children and adults who got dropped out from normal education system owing to financial or other reasons. Thus, it provides opportunity to such people to return to education in a more flexible environment to enhance their knowledge and skills to enable them to lead a better life.

6.2 There are about 20 million children in Pakistan who have missed the boat as they either did not enroll in the primary school at all, or exited very early due to various reasons, such as family not permitting girls to continue their education beyond primary level for cultural reasons, economic compulsions that force low income families to divert children from education to some form of low income employment at very young age. These children can be categorized in age groups 7-9, 10-12, 13-15. Further, there is large number of adults who are either illiterate or semi-literate, and need further education to improve their lives and make them more productive for the country.

6.3 Ignoring education of these children means losing another generation to illiteracy, while the large number of illiterate and semi-literate adults keeps a significant portion of population deprived and unproductive. Not attending to the education of such children and adults will keep a large section of population ill-informed and unskilled that is bound to undermine the progress of the country. While, quite a large number of this population is not be able to complete high school or college, they should at least be able to read, write and do simple mathematics, so that they can read a newspaper, and manage their lives, jobs and

children better, and become useful citizens of the country. Through NFE they should be in a position to be able to acquire basic education ranging from a year to four years, depending on their specific situation and need. This may enable them to rejoin and continue their formal education, pursue vocational education or pursue their occupation with ability to read, write and basic arithmetic skills thereby making them leading a more productive life.

- 6.4 The Citizen's Foundation, the Jung Group and some other academic institutions have prepared a basic coursework for such students attaining non-formal education. A lot of the content is already available in the form of videos prepared by competent teachers in the subjects of English, Mathematics, Sciences, etc, that is available free of cost. There will be a need to provide a recording machine and TV in each class room. Such videos / lessons on computers have already been prepared by 'Sabaq Foundation' and 'United We Reach'. This type of training material will be very helpful for teachers as well as students. Considering that many teachers in government and low-cost private schools lack competency to teach, these videos / lessons will provide them tremendous support to better educate their students. There will be a need to review the existing material, select what is considered more appropriate, and add further material where gaps exist. The course material will also vary based on the age group of the students, as their mental maturity level will be different. Some good academics can be engaged to provide this service.
- 6.5 In order to cover a very large segment of the population, that can most suitably be educated through non-formal education system, it is proposed that the federal and provincial governments should formulate their policies and strategies on NFE, and such strategies should be implemented by establishing Non-Formal Education Organizations (NFEOs). Similar to the concept of BEOs, the NFEOs should also be governed by boards of directors consisting of a combination of people from private and public sector, who have the necessary knowledge, skills and commitment to contribute for this important cause.

Alternatively, the responsibility to manage NFE may also be given to the BEOs.

- 6.6 In order to avoid the infra-structure costs of building schools, the federal and provincial governments can develop programs, whereby NFE centers are established and run by private entrepreneurs in the public sector school buildings in the evenings and on week-ends.
- 6.7 Large number of NFE centers can be established under public private partnerships, by following voucher system being implemented by PEF and SEF, by inviting private sector to run NFE centers using the government infrastructure in the evenings, and government can provide appropriate financial support on per child basis on same principles, as is done by PEF and SEF. Private schools can also be rented in the evenings and week-ends when they are not serving their students. Some large special-purpose NFE centers can be built around the country by donations as well.
- 6.8 Use of technology and existing school infrastructure will help bring the fee per month per student down.
- 6.9 The same model can be extended to improve adult literacy.
- 6.10 BEOs will also launch distance learning programs to support and reinforce its NFE activities, especially to provide learning for disadvantaged children and adults with special needs, who are unable to attend schools.